

Question	Score
David Takacs	
I'm curious what combination of political, legal, ecological factors have made Australia the global leader in biodiversity offsets	14
Given the dynamic nature of a market economy, is offsetting on private land - in which the public has no buy-in - likely to be a long-term solution?	12
What happened to natural capital, ecosystem services and other valuation methods that have risen over the last few years, but now have disappeared....	11
Australia may be leading the way, but where in Australia is doing its best, and why?	8
How important do you think in-perpetuity funds are in ensuring offset sites are maintained in perpetuity? How is this actually achieved?	7
Should developers b given the opp. to use research & monitoring results, to reduce the ongoing financial burden of an assigned offset if impacts are managed?	6
Can different offsets credits overlap in space? Does this have a consequence for the total area protected if multiple credits are accredited to the same area?	6
You asked whether we should direct offsets to corridors. This is good for biodiversity - but how do we deal with land owners who see this as an encumbrance?	5
Is it working in California?	5
should the price of an offset relate to the cost of the offset? How much of a margin is appropriate?	5
Are there any elements of the European Union habitats directive framework that you think are helpful / working well?	5

As a landholder who is not planning on clearing my land why would I take money so that someone else can clear theirs?	5
Biodiversity monitoring is important in evaluating the effectiveness of offsetting. How do we ensure that comprehensive monitoring programs are invested in?	5
As regulators should our focus be more on undertaking strategic assessments i.e. regional scale opportunities, rather than project by project assessments?	5
There is merit in moving the offset model up the hierarchy but how do we balance the risk of creating green deserts by gaining best value for biodiversity	4
Is the cost of offsetting sufficient to incentivise innovative development or appropriate impact minimisation?	4
Do you consider compliance markets for biodiversity will grow in the coming years? Or will they be only led by voluntary initiatives? Víctor G	3
Change of land tenure is common practice as an offset (they are cost effective). However, the conservation gains are debatable. How to encourage other offsets?	3
Where Does NZ sit in regards to offsetting?	3
How much scope is there for other ecosystem markets similar to carbon and biodiversity? Think plastic, sediment flows to the reef, urban trees etc	3
To avoid using offsets to permit development that would otherwise not be permissible, should we be looking at the possibility if development without the offset?	2
In WA cockatoos have moved into exotic pine plantations north of Perth. Conflict has arisen. How to solve this conundrum?	2
Noting the challenge of calculating cause and effect, and assuming offsetting is	2

suitable, how do we take it up a notch and offset impacts in the commons?	
should money be set aside not only for management of offset site and landowner profit but for other investment in on ground conservation e.g. public	2
At what price as a proportion of final resale does avoidance in land development become considered a true hindrance?	1
Time is Money, so bespoke is a challenge to developers and regulators, how do we strike a balance?	1
If the Democrats win, will the US get a Federal offsets program?	1
Does California have a centralised data base for offsets where the monitoring is recorded? If not how else can we learn about effectiveness and share knowledge	1
Noting that offsets should be based on biodiversity priorities and science, as a proponent, how to deal with regulators steering to the opposite direction?	1
What is the scope for national offset systems, as opposed to state-based system, and then by extension what is the scope for international offsetting programs?	1
Hello First question	0
In your example, are there particular challenges having an offset endorsed by the department, what does the department do to alleviate these?	0
Is triple bottom line accounting occurring if species / habitat loss is continuing and developers continue to have profits? (so economic over environment)	0
Martine Maron	
Does securing offsets prior to the impact taking place have a material effect on net loss timeframes at the program and landscape level?	10

In many cases there may be more than one plausible counter-factual. How do you handle calculating the impact of an offset or development in this case?	8
Do environmental assessments gather enough ecological data to determine if NNL has been achieved for that project/offset?	8
Can Risk of Loss for a proposed offset site ever be 0% (i.e. No risk of absolute, ongoing loss of biodiversity values on that site)?	7
Is routine clearing of regrowth vegetation considered a loss or just a reduction in habitat quality?	7
With the mitigation hierarchy, why is a project entirely for profit, e.g. a hotel, that will completely destroy a site not rejected because it could be avoided	6
Should government be held to account and implement offsets in a timely manner, when a proponent pays a cash settlement to the regulator.	6
Does your risk of loss take into account potential future planning policies? There are a lot of places being cleared now that were "protected" 20 yrs ago	6
Proponents often see offset as a first step. Should we be assessing the permissibility of projects before offsets are considered, and enshrining this in the Acts	5
Who decides if the mitigation hierarchy has been applied or landscape scale net loss will occur? Can an offset provider contribute by being blind or choosy?	5
Where minimisation of clearing results in perverse outcomes such as alienation of small non sustainable areas of habitat. Should the alienated area be offset?	4
Is there a risk of all biodiversity eggs in one basket? If every bio offset went to the Amazon, and it all went up in flames, we lose impact AND offset site?	4

What would the Australian Government need to do to implement the target-based ecological compensation approach?	4
Immediate or advanced offsets will always work best to achieve outcomes. How do we make that happen from a practical perspective given offsets are a commodity?	3
In your opinion, can Risk of Loss ever be 0% for an offset site?	3
Proponents frequently over-estimate the Risk of Loss of an offset site. What are the consequences of this?	3
Given that the mitigation hierarchy lacks logic and is not scientifically valid, why don't we just concentrate on identifying what a net gain would look like?	2
What if the offset has no gain, just maintains status quo? Other factors may lead to decline e.g. climate change	2
How should we think about specifying counterfactuals CF at different scales? E.g. CF for evaluating site scale may be different from CF at the landscape scale	2
Why do you set timeframe for site gain at thirty years	2
How is biodiversity value standardised? Each species or community have different priorities and context. E.g. minimum habitat size requirements are different.	2
Would many of the complexities be resolved if we changed terminology from biodiversity offsets to biodiversity compensation?	2
If it is assumed that under the status quo biodiversity values are declining and an offset scheme has a no net loss goal won't biodiversity continue to decline?	2
Surely with the recent and current rate of decline in biodiversity, the fundamental principle should now be "net gain" rather than "no net loss"?	2

Do you think the government and developers would actually support and implement absolute No Net Loss?	1
With target-based compensation, is it expected that developers will be compensating for the illegal clearing that occurs outside of approved development?	1
Why do we talk about best practice in offsetting when the term is not relevant to complex systems with many variables?	1
Often marginal land is regenerating habitat. Will the model account for this?	0
Does EPBC policy deal appropriately with Type 1 impacts?	0
Ascelin Gordon	
Why should a developer be responsible for accounting for losses from other sectors such as through stock grazing, to achieve an absolute no net loss?	4
How does this approach integrate with short-term political cycles and the values driven political will of biodiversity policies?	3
How is your approach different to bioregional conservation planning that should be happening anyway?	2
How can all stakeholders agree to a target? There will usually be groups approaching from the different ends of the scale...	1
Do you consider reserve design principles in your targeting	1
Tor Hundloe	
landholders want to do advanced offsets but the risk of outlaying the initial costs deter them. What role should gov. play in providing financial certainty?	19
Where offsets must be in perpetuity, how do you factor in the perpetual opportunity cost to landowners?	12

How would you integrate climate change considerations into an advance offset system?	8
Why don't you like cash offsets?	7
In your example of the BTF, wouldn't it be necessary to ensure your restoration/translation is successful before allowing the impact?	7
How do you have a market without a metric? What are you trading?	6
How do we best manage the lag that occurs between when an impact occurs and when its offset provides ecological services for the affected values?	5
What level of vegetation (I.e. formation or class) should be offset to achieve like-for-like and avoid reductionist issues like plant community types in NSW?	5
When assessing benefits of offsets, should we consider whether opp. cost to farmer of providing offsets is less than opp. cost to developer of avoiding impact?	4
How do you get the money for offsets straight to the field and bypass government coffers	3
Isn't it true most of our protected areas are for scenic quality, not biodiversity value? How do we prioritise protecting biodiversity on all land?	3
Can we get a copy of a questions	2
Are you suggesting that a credit price is set by the opportunity cost plus a fee for management? Is there a value consideration for the biodiversity assets?	2
What if indirect offsets have a greater benefit? E.g. risk of loss of private properties too low and research closes knowledge gaps important for survival	1
If offsets are a problematic approach... How bad would it be for indigenous	1

biodiversity if we didn't have offsetting for regulated development?	
Christopher Ewing	
If you were to pick one of the state schemes to apply nationally, which would it be and why?	30
Would biodiversity offsets be more effective if there were stricter rules requiring them, rather than the myriad of exemptions that seem to exist?	14
Supply is critical to market function. Do you think payment into a fund impacts on supply? If so, how do we manage this?	14
Is it fair for offset brokers to get the 'best deal' for proponents and landowners even if it means the offsets do not address the Offsets Policy?	14
Should accreditation of independent ecologists be managed by government so consultants paid by proponents cannot bias/fudge results?	11
Would offsets cost less and take less time to be approved if ecological surveys and management plans were done to a high standard the first time?	10
What is your view on earlier comments that a capitalist market mechanism will perpetuate the view of offsets are a shortcut and licence for development?	9
One for Chris: can't the ERF value carbon and biodiversity and pay a better price? At the moment the ERF is set for lowest value and cost.	8
Can you comment on Qld gov cutting future National Parks to nil value	7
Should there be an entirely free market for offset credit trading? Or is some government intervention necessary?	6
How can you supply the right offset when there are inconsistent assessment approaches to their value?	5

Given the complexity of biodiversity, how would assessment of its value and quality (which is often species specific) be quantified in a standardised way?	5
Who will bear the cost of regulating the biodiversity market?	4
How do you find the demand on a large scale that it is genuine demand	1
Forestry done well is not a threat to biodiversity. Listen to the science!	0
Alan Key	
Without in perpetuity, how do you achieve the long-term ecological gain?	39
Isn't having an exit strategy against the spirit of biodiversity offsets?	30
Which of the state schemes would you choose to apply nationally and why?	23
Do offset brokers need to have a good understanding of Ecology, particularly vegetation, flora and fauna identification?	23
Should there be an accreditation and licensing scheme for offset brokers?	20
Should "return on investment" include an income stream for conservation works/management actions AND profit for the landowner? Or just management actions?	13
To provide policy certainty don't we need to prove offsets deliver. To prove that, we need comprehensive monitoring programs. Would this help provide certainty?	10
How do you mitigate your risk as an offset provider in a market as governmental assessment outcomes and their value of the offsets continually change	10
Should brokers be required to pass an ecological knowledge test to be enabled to broker?	8

What impacts have you been offsetting in Queensland? Under what policy/development requirement?	7
Can you describe some of the biodiversity outcomes of long term offset sites you've been involved with?	7
Why do they need an exit strategy? Legal security protects the investment. Would selling a credit provide this? Or buying it back?	6
You mentioned you "can't take in perpetuity into the market place", what would the "exit strategy" involve? Does this mean selling the offset to government?	6
Should there be a transparent, public register or credit exchange to allow free market trade, rather than a controlled or silent market?	5
How can we reconcile a market as described when we are not pricing natural capital at an equivalent level?	4
We have the people in this room to advise govts to set up the framework for a market. What should we do?	4
If we build a new biodiversity market, could we simultaneously include other ecosystem services like plastic, sediment flows into the reef, urban trees etc?	4
Should offset policies address force majeure events to ensure proponents no longer have a liability if an event out of their control destroys their offset site?	3
Should offset policies be implemented strictly or should they be taken as more of a guideline?	2
Should all land purchased for offsets be gifted to the state or commonwealth to be managed by them as part of conservation estate?	2
Offsets are meant to be implemented for the duration of an impact. This rarely	2

happens. Could an offsets market improve this?	
Why do we need institutional investors for a viable market?	2
Can you aggregate smaller offsets into larger landscape scale offsets?	2
Is there a place for large scale investors in the Australian offsets market? are we big enough?	1
Questions for Alan now open	0
We are doing a better job of implementing offsets policies than in the past. If this means proponents have to provide more offsets, should we continue improving	0
Who sets the price? And on what basis- what the provider thinks he/she can get?	0
how Do you balance scale needed to recognise biodiversity to be protected against s unit of trade that could operate nationally	0
Problem is current attitude is that if an area is voluntarily protected then it can't be put into the market. Can we change this?	0
Maria Kwiatkowska	
Will the BCT say No if you don't think you can secure like for like offsets	31
Do developers pay enough for the offset to be managed and monitored for the duration of the impact?	28
Two years into the new scheme and a single stewardship agreement. Can you comment on the impact of pricing for payment into the BCF on this supply component?	21
Does moderating the questions (and filtering out the tough ones despite them being popular) defeat the purpose of this forum?	19
Do you think that landholders are setup to deliver offset management actions since it	16

is often not their core business (conflicting interests of graziers etc)	
Has the BCT had offset obligations where the offset is just not available?	15
Are your running costs covered by offset payments you receive?	15
What happens when a credit type is unavailable - how does the legal liability for like for like get altered and is that post approval changes to all?	14
Where have you retired your credits and has this been a biodiversity win?	14
Do the transactions of the BCT tenders get published on the Public Registers? Does this also factor into credit pricing in the market?	12
When you see cheap credit offers come in does that ring alarm bells that the landholder hasn't considered the full cost of delivery and maintenance?	11
How is capital interest used on the \$10million? Is it used to source additional credits?	10
How are you able to manage potential collusion when running the reverse auctions, and do you think collusion will become a greater risk over time?	9
What do you think the Qld government could learn from the NSW experience of delivering a market-based offset scheme?	8
Does this approach aim to ensure no net loss of biodiversity values?	8
Must BCT offsets be in NSW?	7
It seems very developer friendly, how is biodiversity prioritised?	7
Have the BCT found it difficult to source like-for-like BAM credits at the price that proponents have contributed to the fund?	6

How much of the BCT offset investment goes to admin compared to on ground action?	6
You can scale back ecological restoration but never really cease management - how do you not manage into perpetuity and hence have a in to perpetuity agreement	5
when credits retire, can they then be sold back into the market?	5
What is the timeframe for BCT to be approved for use where EPBC approval requirements also apply?	5
Can u comment on buy in costs to set up an offset and lack of certainty in outcomes. Huge issue at qld and federal level.	5
Offsets taking 2 years to be implemented (not even delivering required outcomes) ...does this time lag impact on biodiversity conservation?	4
Credit prices are based on trades under the former BioBanking scheme. Credit values & credit yields are now much lower. Much uncertainty. Can you address this?	4
How many hectares are under management through BCT?	3
Do you have capacity to invest in outcomes that are not like for like?	3
If land remains in private ownership and management, how is in perpetuity guaranteed?	3
any appetite to reduce the opportunity to pay into the trust in future - more pressure on developers to find their own sites or is there merit in taking cash?	3
Are the bct tender credit sales and fixed price offers being fed into the bct payment fund, thus influencing the credit pricing market?	3
What obligation is there on BCT to ensure the landholder meets TFD through	3

purchase against a BCT obligation to ensure offsetting actually occurs?	
Does the total fund deposit account for department cost recovery in compliance visits/audits?	3
Has anyone wanted to get out of an agreement? And if so what happened?	3
How many stewardship sites have the BCT helped landowners set up?	2
Would it be useful for the BCT to be the entity setting the Biodiversity Offset Payment Calculator prices?	2
When and how do you use your Revolving fund to secure credits? How has this been received by the landowners purchasing the land?	2
How do you promote these tenders to landholders? How do they know they are happening and how to price their land?	2
How much does it cost to deliver this program?	2
Have you observed any change to activity in the open credit market since the option of being able to pay into the Trust has come into play?	2
Is there intention or a contingency plan for the government to contribute money to the fund, not just rely on developer money?	2
By proponents paying BCT to implement their offsets obligations, is this putting too much onus on the government?	1
How is the fund invested?	1
Questions for Maria now open	0
Kerry ten Kate	
Do you think a country wide policy is preferable over multiple fragmented state-based policies?	23
What do you think of pooled trusts for the delivery of offsets into which developers	22

can pay to cash out their offset obligation - words of advice (or warning)?	
You mentioned cumulative impacts - what is current best practice in assessing cumulative impacts?	19
Should the onus be on regulatory bodies to assess projects based on an understanding of its contribution to cumulative impact?	11
How do we get over the problem of governments loving to launch a new policy but refusing to adequately resource running the new offering system?	9
biodiv is currently on the decline in Aus. which is used as evidence offsets don't work. Given offsets are new do u think it's too early to make that judgment?	8
Should offset requirements be increased to account for cumulative impacts, and how would these be quantified?	6
Are you suggesting the results at Sabah will be similar elsewhere-i.e. if you can't achieve NNL in Sabah you're unlikely to get it elsewhere	5
You mentioned that 'trading-up' was an appropriate option - State and Federal legislation does not allow this - should it change here in Australia?	5
Are there examples of blended financing or subsidies by central governments to fill the 'investment gap' for revegetation to help offsets become viable	5
Won't effective offsetting only be possible when clear rule of law applies on environmental matters and native vegetation removal is regulated well in a nation?	4
NNL/NG vs compensation? Is this the natural evolution of the offset concept to something more practical and achievable?	4
What do you think is the biggest barrier to robust offset design - and does that barrier vary globally?	3

We have good offset policies and tools but modest uptake to-date. How to expand scope of liability for losses and strengthen enforcement of offsets?	2
If averting loss isn't permitted as part of biodiversity offsets delivery, what would that mean for biodiversity outcomes	2
Questions for Kerry now open	1
How to translate CBD targets into national biodiversity baselines and conservation commitments, and ensure biodiversity offsets count towards delivery?	1
In considering indirect impacts, should we take into account the mitigating factors renewable energy projects have on biodiversity loss through climate change?	1
How important is understanding the institutional architecture framework of countries, as opposed to just focusing on individual projects?	1
Nick Thomas	
How does veg clearing by agriculture fit into the BOS? Agriculture clears more land than mining/developers, but In the BOS agriculture are conservationists	17
Research has shown that offsets credits and offsets funds rarely cover the cost of management and monitoring. Is this the case with NSW?	17
Is the 20-year payment/management period long enough, particularly for developments with an enduring impact?	15
A lot of chat about State and Fed offset policies, however local gov are the ones delivering on ground. Why are local gov not included more in the conversation?	10
Given the backlog in rolling out projects in the fund, does this contradict the requirement for offsets to precede impact?	8

Do you think this approach achieves No Net Loss of biodiversity values?	6
How can you organise credits in advance for features that take a very long time to develop, such as tree hollows?	6
What are the downsides of effectively privatising biodiversity by offsetting on private land, if the general public have 'no skin in the game'?	5
With credit prices as on BOPC, the maximum cost to development is \$143 per sq m in a CEEC. is this fair when land later sells at more than \$750/m2?	5
By advancing offsets do you negate opportunities to reduce impacts during the project?	3
Have the management funds allocated under the scheme been adequate to manage threats and habitat quality decline over time?	1
Questions for Nick now open	0
Carole Rayner	
Is the Qld gov concerned about the 96% of land clearing not being captured by the offsetting?	33
How much money paid into the fund has been used on the ground	26
Do you think that offset ratio of 4:1 is enough to achieve No Net Loss?	21
Lots of chat about State and Fed gov offset policy, however local gov are the ones delivering on ground. Why are local gov largely kept out of the conversation?	13
Does the financial settlement for offsets cover the cost of implementing the offset, or is the government having to subsidise costs?	12
How many offset projects and hectares have been secured to date through the financial settlement mechanism?	12

What challenges have you faced with the financial settlement option? Are there any cautionary tales for the NSW Biodiversity Conservation Fund?	11
I read your slide as saying 800ha of offsets against about 20,000 ha of impacts. Is that correct, and if so when will they catch up?	11
Why a cap on multipliers? Does this undermine the scientific rigour behind the scheme and wouldn't it risk misrepresenting achievement of NNL outcomes?	10
Are state infrastructure projects required to undertake offsetting?	10
Has an offset ever been deemed not suitable under the current framework?	8
With reference to Kerry's presentation, is "No net loss" a realistic description when less than 5% of impacts are considered?	7
For the financial payments how quickly are the offsets being located, agreed and secured? Does this happen close to impact timing?	6
How do you calculate the financial settlement?	5
What are the anticipated changes to the policy that will come out as a result of the policy review?	5
Can a state offset framework that only requires offsets for a very small proportion of clearing achieve no net loss?	5
Why is there such difference between location of impact and offset site? If there are rules to keep in same bioregion is this working?	5
Do you think it's appropriate that Economic Development Queensland has their own koala offsets policy and fund for priority development areas?	4
Why is the rate of delivery so high for payment scheme? Is there a premium cost	4

or any rate that covers admin for delivery? Is this the preferred option and why	
How has the Qld Govt spent its offset financial contributions received? Is there an action plan or strategic plan to spend the funds each year?	4
How do you calculate the amount of the financial settlement?	3
What are the offset ratios if a proponent wishes to clear an offset area?	3
how do offset systems in Australia reconcile such generous exemptions?	3
I assume priority projects require clearing of large land but they don't need offset?	3
Is there a contingency if no net loss is not achieved?	3
The graph suggests that the offset payments average out to \$3000 per hectare. Is this sufficient for good on ground outcomes?	3
Is the avoid and mitigate strongly imposed on projects?	2
What's the rationale for including special least concern fauna as MSES, but excluding near threatened fauna species?	2
Will upcoming changes to qld framework lower the barriers for advanced offsets (i.e. more certainty for owners, lower initial assessment costs?	1
Why do proponent driven offsets have strict timeframes for delivery whilst financial settlement pools are not being implemented?	1
Questions for Carol now open	0
What is a 'conservation outcome' - what sort of outcome? Is it the same as no net loss?	0
Are the significant residual impact tests based on no net loss?	0

John Seidel	
Yesterday you were going to say what you'd change if you had your time again, what was your answer?	15
What % of land / vegetation clearing in NSW requires offsetting?	14
The # of a species in an area may not increase with an improvement in the vegetation integrity if the population is at carrying capacity. How is this addressed?	12
The BAM appears to be easily influenced by observer variation, how did u account for this?	11
Why is there a disproportionate number/value of species credits to ecosystem credits?	10
Were the material differences in credits being generated at stewardship sites versus BBAM agreement sites and the effect of this on the market fully considered?	7
How is management funded after 20 years if the site doesn't reach benchmark condition?	7
How to account for gain when doing habitat augmentation for threatened species habitat through use nest boxes/creating hollows when not linked to veg integrity?	7
How do you define 'habitat' for a plant? Is it reliable?	6
Why hasn't context and connectivity been considered in the metrics?	6
How is restoration gain achieved if no restoration activities are required until 100% total fund deposit is reached?	6
Under the BOS can impacts/developments be approved to occur on an offset site?	4
What are your metrics for measuring restoration gain?	4

Does this approach underestimate the time it takes for woodlands to reach benchmark?	4
Any comments/ experiences from nsw with applying metrics to wetlands and inter tidal areas?	3
Why is veg integrity not a bell curve? i.e. when condition attributes pass benchmark shouldn't condition score then reduce?	3
All these metrics look worthy but complex. Couldn't we just simplify everything to achieve a similar or better outcome?	3
Does DPIE query and cross-check the habitat quality scores provided by proponents?	2
Questions open	0
What considerations were taken into account between the legislation that exists in NSW? I.e. BC Act and SEPP 44	0
Scott Whiting	
Was baseline of the Fatback Turtle population determined prior to the impact associated with the project?	14
How did you consider or assess the counterfactual i.e. the outcomes if the offset (or impact) didn't occur?	12
What are the results of the monitoring showing so far? Is the project impacting on the turtle population?	12
Results to date? Is the turtle no worse off or better off now despite developing Barrow island?	12
Can you summarise the complexities in legal frameworks for ensuring ongoing marine conservation? How do these compare to terrestrial mechanisms e.g. covenants	9
How was the \$60 million developed and agreed? What do you think is best way to determine amount of indirect offsets for a project?	7

If this is an offset why are "partners" required to make financial contributions? Could you explain this concept please	7
This seems like a lot of monitoring indicators. Have there been any difficulties managing that number?	5
How do we know that 60 million is an appropriate amount?	5
Has climate change been factored into for offsets in relation to the Flatback Turtle?	4
Could the value, pressure and knowledge method be used to determine offset priorities?	4
You mentioned this project was a special case -under ministerial agreement. How can marine conservation projects link in to existing biodiversity frameworks?	2
Impacts to nesting beaches is just one of many impacts. How do you integrate these other impacts into your management framework?	1
Questions for Scott now open	0
Travis Peake	
In your experience, are the costs of offsets causing developers to avoid and minimise impacts?	31
How do consultants deal with pressure from proponents to reduce their offset liability?	26
Does being paid by the proponents influence consultants to act outside of the best interests for threatened species and ecological communities?	20
Do you think better outcomes are achieved via the NSW or Cth system?	20
Why do consultants and regulators so often disagree on application of offset metrics e.g. EPBC Act offsets assessment guide?	18

You said the Commonwealth sometimes reject the consultants balance sheet and fill it themselves. Is this fair, given the consultant is often the MNES expert?	11
Who should determine what is significant impact?	9
Do you think that surveys undertaken by consultants are generally adequate to accurately determine the impact on biodiversity values?	9
Do you think metrics can be simplified in order to make offset delivery easier to deliver without sacrificing outcomes?	6
Most of the time, the survey data is not adequate to determine inputs into the offset's calculator with certainty. What is done to address this?	5
I have found that only being able to score condition under EPBC to an integer value (no fractions) is problematic. What is your view on this?	5
Time until ecological benefit is not a 20-year maximum as stated on a slide. Would a longer time until ecological benefit result in adverse impacts?	5
Can biodiversity assessments and the data available on expected gains in NSW simply be input to the EPBC calculator - since the principles of gain are the same?	5
If significant impacts are what triggers EPBC Act offsets then what is negligible?	4
In your experience, what is better to achieve an offset outcome, buying up land and outsourcing management or involving landholders ("leasing of land")?	3
What are your thoughts on whether mine rehabilitation can achieve a functioning plant community	3
Plenty of EPBC offsets include mine rehab, but additional offsets are required to make up for the time delay. How does NSW consider this?	3

Do you think there would be more consistency from DoEE if consultants provided a consistently high standard of work and substantial ecological data?	3
You skipped the SAll how are you addressing these issues when thresholds have not been developed	2
Under the BAM, all indirect impacts should be considered. Therefore, should coal and gas ecological impacts of burning fossil fuel be considered?	2
Do you pirate to best practice methods even if the proponent is to willing to pay for it?	1
Could you expand on principles for demonstrating avoidance?	1
Questions for Travis now open	0
In your opinion would there be value in having developer licence to operate tied to explicit biodiversity offset outcomes.	0
Adam Schutz	
In some ecosystems, biodiversity is driven by top down forces (fauna) and not bottom up (plants). How can SA not involve fauna in biodiversity offsetting?	28
Did I hear correctly does the SA model actually manage agricultural lands- same set of criteria as other developments or different set of criteria for ag	23
What is the overall balance of clearing vs offsets - is SA better or worse off	15
were historical non-compliance issues addressed or was this just too difficult?	13
Concerning that SA assessments and offsets don't really consider fauna, especially as there are next to no EPBC referrals. Who's protecting these species?	11
Is ten years management enough to ensure the benefits last in perpetuity?	10

To what extent does the decrease in clearing rates over time reflect there being no native vegetation left to clear?	8
Do you believe landholders can deliver offsets since it is often not their core business?	8
Why are there next to no epic referrals from SA?	7
Is \$20,000 per hectare management cost enough?	7
How did you determine the \$20,000 per ha management cost? What if Land requires more or less management, changing costs for management?	7
Does the reduction in vegetation clearing rates over time reflect the impact of legislation, or does it reflect reduction in vegetation available for clearing?	5
Are there offsets in SA for impacts to threatened species that are not occurring in native vegetation? How are residual impacts considered in statutory approvals	5
You mentioned the high level of protection for good quality vegetation. Is illegal clearing effectively monitored and prosecuted?	5
With a loss: offset area ratio in the range of 1:30-50, is there an extreme shortage of suitable offset sites?	5
Does it cost less for proponents to pay into the offset fund as opposed to them implementing on ground offsets?	5
Does the fund result in a time lag between impact and offset? How does this promote the value of restoring habitat before its impacted?	5
From a regulatory perspective what are the metrics used to measure success of revegetated offset sites?	4
How well has the notion of offsetting been socialised with the farming community?	3

How do you check or verify (the level of proponent effort) that avoidance has occurred, and the siting of offsets occur as close as possible to the impact?	3
Any landholder compensation costs in the SEB payment?	3
In your SEB payment criteria there doesn't appear to be a landholder payment component? Do landholders only receive mgt funds?	3
How is it determined how much a development needs to offset?	2
Is the 10-year management plan long enough to achieve the required environmental outcomes?	2
Have you had to demonstrate gains in situations where multiple parties are undertaking restoration/threat abatement over the same land?	2
How do you address habitat loss for EPBC protected fauna? Given the low-cost clearing in scrubland for instance.	2
How much \$ of the SA fund has been spent on on ground offsets?	2
How do you measure a generic SEB so that you can compare it with a specific loss - how many mallee emu wrens are worth how many spiny crayfish?	1
Area approved at \$20k/ha management costs does not correlate to total funds received?	1
As less suitable offset land becomes available over time, is this taken into account when calculating monetary offset payments?	1
Questions for Adam open	0
Renee Rossini	
How much of your work is restoring cleared areas VS managing existing vegetated area back to a remnant status?	10

Is the koala habitat offset of equivalent (or better) quality compared to the impacted (cleared) koala habitat?	10
You took cattle out. Does this mean grazing and offsets can't co-exist, e.g. cattle need to be taken off the land to achieve good offset outcomes	10
Any insights on the 7:30 Report re. EPBC Act Koala offsets?	9
How have you been managing feral animals within KC?	9
Do proponents pay enough to TFN for adequate monitoring and management of offsets?	7
The Flinders Karawatha corridor relies on the Greenbank military training area. How do you reconcile fauna connectivity with chain mesh fences and the C'wth	7
What are your timeframes? Is the general 20 years associated with offsets long enough?	5
Is feral pest control an important part of site management? Has it been attributed to the increase in koala activity?	5
With the reveg site, how old will the eucalypts need to be before they could sustain a Koala population?	4
How successful is scat surveys for use in monitoring? Have you looked at other methods like song metres or drones?	3
What data collection tools are u using to track koala usage, abundance, presence	2
Do you think that home range of koalas is based on the secondary browse species	1
Questions for Renee now open	0
How do you go about establishing the management costs you require to fund implementation of the management actions	0

Why would the KC offset area have lower chlamydia disease rates than I'm REG	0
What is your baseline for restoration at this site? And why?	0
What system do you use to store data and inform management?	0
Chris McCombe	
What percentage of profits from mining are invested in biodiversity conservation?	29
Isn't using mine rehab as offsets equivalent to being asked to be paid to pick up your toys?	28
What are some ways the mining industry is applying the 'avoidance' principle given mines are largely dictated by resource location? Does avoidance come into play?	25
Do you believe that resource extraction should always be prioritised over biodiversity conservation?	17
Offsets are meant to be implemented for the duration of the impact, however the mining industry does not follow this. What is MCAs take on this?	17
Why abandon like for like?	14
How does the MCA balance certainty vs cost in offset requirements? Would a high certainty but high cost offset system be supported?	13
How do you think cumulative impacts need to be addressed? And should government be involved with planning for the next 20 years of impacts?	11
From a proponent's perspective what would a good offsets policy look like - what are industries key concerns?	9
How do the minerals council consider and address climate change?	8

If offsets are too hard to find and/or expensive isn't this an indication the resource project is not a good idea?	8
Why is she wearing safety glasses but no gloves?	7
What role does MCA play in advocating responsible resource development (ethical, environmental) over endorsement of unethical, unacceptable projects (e.g.Adani)	7
For no Net Loss to be achieved, research shows larger offset areas are required. Does Minerals Council support this, noting that it would reduce profits of clients	6
What metrics are gathered to actually measure outcomes rather than green wash with lovely pictures of projects?	6
Why should the mine rehabilitation be recognised in reducing your liability?	6
Do you just want to pay into an offset fund to make it easier for mining companies to dismiss their environmental impact?	6
Most minerals in an iPhone r sourced from high biodiversity/conflict states overseas. What role does MCA play in mapping biodiversity impacts in supply chains?	5
How is moving away from like-for-like protecting biodiversity?	5
What is the mining industry doing to ensure its offsets in northern Australia are permanent?	3
How do offsets delay mining projects even though they usually commence without implementing any offsets?	3
How do you define 'Prohibitively expensive' in terms of an offset cost	3
Questions for Chris now open	2
How would industry be able to deal with in perpetuity offset requirements?	2

Mining infrastructure occupies a small proportion of the Australian landscape but what is the percentage covered by mining leases?	2
Were you saying your rehabilitation efforts should be factored in such that your liability for offset is reduced?	2
Where is the bang for buck losses in offsets arising from state and federal regulations?	2
What role will the MCA play in driving strategic approaches?	2
Does MCA consider that an impact should not be allowed if offsets are scarce for that matter?	2
What is the industry's view on pooled funds not being used?	2
How do you define prohibitively costly?	1
Why would you buy out farmers to provide an offset?	1
What's the solution if offsets are getting harder to find? Pay outs? Is this achieving the best env, social and cultural outcomes	1
Due to technology we can now access resources that we couldn't previously including rehabilitated land and offsets. Is resource extraction more important	1
With the long lead times associated with mine developments can this time be used to identify acquire and get advanced on like for like offsets to minimise delays	1
Gareth Rees	
Will there be fauna movement infrastructure?	21
How do you quantify connectivity impacts, and how do you design offsets that you can be confident will compensate for those offsets?	20
Was avoidance part of the decision-making matrix when deciding the location	18

of new routes? Especially if ecology isn't front and centre in the vision	
When time is an issue why does the ecological offset become the lowest priority?	18
Most railway projects consider impacts of construction but not ongoing impacts such as fauna being hit by trains. How does Inland Rail address this concern?	17
Will fauna mortality as a result of the project be offset somehow?	13
Are offsets not considered during the early planning stages? If not why? As offsets are not a new thing.	13
If you are already aware of potential offsets requirements and you want to take a strategic approach then why can't you do that?	11
If you can't find an offset for something, such as Murray Cod in one area, why not avoid that impact?	10
Is Inland Rail certified by the Infrastructure Sustainability Council of Australia and does ISCA require biodiversity offsets? To what standard?	7
How fast will the trains go?	5
Why don't ARTC maintain a bank of offset credit to account for these projects?	4
I couldn't understand the problem with finding a Murray cod offset?	3
Australian systems seem to be able to offset anything. Were there non offsettable impacts for this project? How addressed?	3
You want flexibility around timeframes for implementing offsets. Have you considered the significant impact of the associated ecological time lag??	3
A lot of the alignment is existing track so shouldn't ARTC have a solid baseline to provide for a rapid impact assessment?	2

Great point that developments could also coordinate their offsetting to be strategic		2
Is there a rail link from Inland Rail (Bris to Melb) to Sydney?	1	
Questions open		0
What are the implications/carbon offset of not building this infrastructure		0
Kate Auty		
Who enforces compliance with offset requirements under a strategic assessment?		15
Does your office actively monitor and audit offset areas in Canberra? If so, are most offsets failing or succeeding?		15
Didn't the golden sun moth offset site across the road just get sold to developers?		13
Does ACT allow development to occur on an area that was set aside as an offset for a previous impact?		8
You audited compliance with the strategic assessment. Any insights into whether the conditions of the assessment were, in hindsight, any good?		7
To what extent is calling a river corridor an offset actually just avoiding an area that can't be developed and mitigating the indirect adjacent impacts?		7
As many non-compliances were around timeframes, what could the government do to reduce the risk of this non-compliance with reducing enforceability?		7
strategic assessment is for a period of 20-30 years. How does an audit at 5years adequately determine compliance given ecology is not stationary?		5
Is an offset for 20 years long enough for Box-Gum woodlands TEC, particularly on previously cleared land?		4

When is the state of the environment report being made public?	3
Do you think the potential for set and forget should be considered in the timing of delivery of offsets?	3
Do you foresee significant non-compliance with offset approval conditions as demonstration of final conservation gains are required 20 years from now?	3
When will the SA for Eastern Broadacre happen?	0
Questions for Kate now open	0